

**Terms of Reference for
Conducting a Multi-State Impact Evaluation Survey of
Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Rural Livelihoods Mission (DAY-
NRLM)**

Background

1. The Ministry of Rural Development (MoRD), Government of India (GoI) launched the National Rural Livelihoods Mission (NRLM) in 2011. The key thrust of NRLM is rural poverty reduction through the creation and strengthening of institutional platforms of the rural poor. The centrally sponsored NRLM provides a combination of financial resources and technical support to the states to implement a comprehensive livelihoods approach to rural poverty alleviation. The approach of the Mission encompasses four-interlinked components viz., (a) mobilization of all rural poor households into effective Self Help Groups (SHGs), SHG federations and other organizations, in a phased manner; (b) enhancing access to financial, technical and livelihood support services; (c) building capacities and skills for gainful and sustainable livelihoods; and finally (d) improving the inclusive delivery of social and economic support services to the poor in convergence with other rural development programmes.

2. The mandate of the Mission is to cover over 8 crore rural poor households, across more than 650 districts, 6,000 blocks, 250,000 Gram Panchayats and 600,000 villages in the country through self-managed Self Help Groups and their federations and support them for livelihoods over a period of eight to ten years.

3. The Mission is financed on a cost-sharing basis between the GoI and the state governments. The distribution of GoI allocation to the states is based on the inter-state rural poverty ratios. In order to augment the resources required for implementation of NRLM in 13 high poverty states, the GoI has entered into an agreement with the World Bank (IDA credit) for assistance of about US \$500 Million, with closing date of 30th June, 2018. Thus, apart from NRLM allocation, GoI provides additional funds to 13 states which account for 85% of the total rural poor in the country. These states are: Assam, Chhattisgarh, Bihar, Gujarat, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal.

4. As part of the loan agreement, the MoRD, Gol is required to get an impact evaluation of NRLM done by commissioning baseline and follow-up studies and submit Implementation Completion Report (ICR). As part of the impact evaluation, 13 states that received additional funds under IDA credit completed baseline studies through independent agencies. These studies provided valuable information to the states on the baseline rural livelihood situation that informed their strategies and Annual Action Plans (AAPs). Conducting final impact evaluation studies by 13 different states would not only be expensive but could result in time delays. Besides, conduct of studies by different independent agencies adopting varied methodologies may bring-up conflicting evidence. Therefore, to ensure uniformity in methodology, and to complete the evaluation within the stipulated time, the MoRD-Gol has decided to commission an independent final evaluation of NRLM, covering seven representative states out of 13 that have received additional funds under IDA credit. However, the final study would make use of the baseline data collected in the 7 states as part of their baseline studies for evaluating the impact.

Purpose and Objective of Evaluation

5. The MoRD-Gol, seeks to commission an independent impact evaluation study (end-line study) of NRLM in seven states viz., Bihar, Jharkhand, Odisha, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Chhattisgarh and Rajasthan. The objective of the study is to evaluate the impact of NRLM by tracking changes in the socio-economic indicators of rural households in the villages targeted under the Mission. Some of the indicators that need to be assessed in the survey include changes in asset base, income, consumption, savings, access to loans, terms and conditions of loans, access to work/ employment (self or wage-based) opportunities, food security, health status and nutrition, access to entitlements and public services, quality of life and empowerment. In addition, information needs to be collected on SHGs and their federations as well as on the village level parameters.

6. The MoRD-Gol therefore seeks to hire the services of an independent agency or consortium of independent agencies (hereinafter referred to as the Agency) that would be responsible for collecting, in an efficient and reliable manner, panel data at the household, self-help group and village levels. The objective is to conduct a follow-up survey (also referred to as end-line survey) in the 7 states indicated above, following the sampling plan and methodology suggested.

Scope of Work and Activities

7. The central responsibility of the agency is to carry out a comprehensive end-line survey as per the sample indicated. The agency selected and finally contracted will work under the direct supervision of the NRLM, MoRD-Gol.

8. The agency is required to undertake the survey using the technology platforms indicated, such as, hand-held electronic devices for data capture and real-time data transfer using digital servers for data storage (popularly called computer-assisted personal interviewing, or CAPI). The agency bidding for the contract must demonstrate prior experience with digital data collection using tablets and/or hand-held devices.

9. More particularly, the agency will be responsible for the following key activities:

Translating, Adapting, Pre-Testing and Using CAPI Survey Instruments

10. The agency will undertake translation of paper-based questionnaires developed in English by the Core Evaluation Team of NRLM into **Hindi, Oriya and Marathi** and develop software application which is compatible with mobile devices and digital servers. The agency is expected to conduct two rounds of pilot testing of CAPI based surveys in non-sampled areas and fine-tune the software for data digitization and capture in at least 100 households from 10 villages. After each pilot, the agency will work closely with the evaluation team to adapt, revise and finalize the CAPI survey instruments and tools. It is expected that the agency will draw on its own field experience and expertise in providing inputs to the evaluation team on the implementation of survey instruments. The completed surveys will have to be uploaded on to a back-end server. The agency must also possess capacity and experience with the development and use of the required server. The evaluation team must be provided real-time access to data being uploaded on the servers.

11. It is suggested that the agency will adopt CAPI-based data collection software such as CSPro or ODK. The agency will ensure that all data is checked for accuracy and discrepancies before entry.

12. The data entry application must be robust and satisfy the following conditions:

- to the greatest extent possible, the data entry program should conduct range and consistency checks, as the questionnaire is key punched;

- violations of these checks should lead to an immediate and transparent message sent to the key puncher, along with a practical method for correcting keypunch errors, and/or over-riding and documenting any answers that violate the range and consistency check rules;
- the program should allow valid open-ended and “other” textual responses outside of the response options provided in the questionnaire;
- variable names generated by the program should correspond clearly and logically to the question labels used in the questionnaire;
- coding strategy should be developed in order to maintain consistent, unique identifiers for households for matching longitudinal data; and
- the program and the devices should be able to record the complete interview audio.

13. The agency must have relevant experience in handling the data collection through technology-based modes. The agency will be expected to propose a Software Development Team (either in-house or through a partnership with another agency) to manage the software as well as server development for the survey.

Training of Enumerators

14. The agency will ensure that all supervisors participate in the centralized training programme that the evaluation team proposes to organize at Ranchi (Jharkhand) or any other location. This training will include classroom training followed by field training for a total of 4 to 6 days . The supervisor training will be followed by enumerator training, which will include field training for a total of 6 to 8 days. The batch size for supervisor training has to be 10-12 per batch and the enumerator training has to be in batches of 30-40 per batch. The evaluation team will lead the classroom trainings with the agency. However, the agency is expected to support in all aspects of the training, particularly the field training. Supervisors from the agency are expected to lead the field training with the support of the evaluation team. The agency will translate training manuals from English to Hindi, Oriya and Marathi. Specific training duties which are required of the agency include but not limited to:

- translation of training materials and detailed interviewer, supervisor and data entry manuals in close collaboration with the evaluation team;
- in-depth training of all field staff, including practice interviews, role plays and other similar exercises; and
- field training to conduct interviews as per agreed procedures (initially by team supervisors).

Data Collection Activities

15. The agency will ensure that the following surveys are conducted as per the sample plan prescribed and using the tools approved:

Household Survey Schedule

16. The household survey schedule comprising multiple modules is expected to take about 180- 210 minutes per household in one to two sittings per household. However, the modules will be administered to men and women from the households in different time slots to avoid respondent fatigue. Information will have to be collected through interviews as well as direct observation. The list of sample households along with contact details, (address and phone number) will be supplied to the agency. Locating these households will be the responsibility of the enumerators and supervisors. The agency will be required to prepare materials for field staff including maps, names of heads of household and any other identifying characteristics with the support of the evaluation team. The methodology to identify 'replacement households' will be provided to the agency. The respondents to be interviewed for different modules will be determined by the evaluation team. The household survey will include but not be restricted to:

- household roster and socio-economic modules, including individual level demographic, education, labor/employment and other information;
- household economy module, including a detailed assets, occupation and employment and other productive activities, income (total and from different sources) and expenditure modules;
- household savings and debt module that includes savings, investment, access to formal and informal sources of borrowing, indebtedness and cost of debt servicing and other conditions of loans;
- household participation in SHG-module that collects information on participation in SHGs, membership history, resources, benefits and services received through SHGs, empowerment of women through participation in SHGs *etc*;
- access of household to basic services that includes information on access to water, sanitation, housing, power, ICDS, schools, mid-day meals, preventive and curative health services, pensions and other social assistance, PDS/NFS *etc*;
- household participation in PRIs and other community level collectives and organizations;
- household physical characteristics module that documents the location, type and size of housing and related facilities including road access; and
- GPS/GIS information relating to each household.

SHG Survey Schedule

17. The SHG survey schedule will be administered to a group of (2-3) Office Bearers and other informed persons who are members of SHG covered in the baseline survey. The SHG survey schedule will *inter alia* include:

- a module on basic information of SHG covering such as details of members in the SHG, their basic socio-demographic information of SHG members (age, occupation, which social group they belong to), age of the SHG, membership attrition (in the last 2 years etc.);
- a module on micro-finance activities of SHG including savings generated, inter-lending undertaken by purpose, assets and liabilities of the SHG, economic activities of the members (individual and collective) and books, bookkeeper and bookkeeping practices;
- a module on access of the SHG to RF, CIF, VRF, other livelihood funds and access to bank credit as well as use of the funds received among different members and the recovery of such funds and repayment to the banks;
- a module on governance processes instituted in the SHG (internal group dynamics, leader selection, participation, regularity of meetings), and SHG links with Village Organizations as well as external organizations (GP/block office, NGOs, village leaders etc);
- a module on inclusion of the poor and vulnerable in SHGs, in which detailed data on social background of members, disbursement of loan funds among households belonging to different social groups and Office Bearers, percentage of funds received by poor and ultra-poor households, other information on members and leaders; and
- a module on SHG level interactions assessed through participatory tools.

Village Survey Schedule

18. A village survey will be implemented in each sample village. The survey will be collected through key informant interviews with a group of (3-5) key informants. The informants should be people who are knowledgeable about the village. Data collected in this survey will include information on locality characteristics, services, infrastructure and access to markets, village-level public spending and program implementation. The purpose of this survey is to assess how initial conditions (general access to services and infrastructure, literacy etc), and links to markets and the presence of other government and non-government programs/spending influence the impact of the Mission.

Village Organization Survey Schedule

19. The Village organization survey will be administered to a group of (2-3) key respondents who are members of Village organizations. The VO survey schedule will include:

- a module on the operational details of the VO, in which data collected will include basic background information of the VO, number of SHG members in the VO, age of the VO;

- governance structures and processes – OBs, EC and GB, registration details, transparency and accountability systems instituted; social and educational background of OBs and EC members, VO internal group dynamics, leader selection/rotation, regularity of meetings etc;
- financial transactions of the VO – own funds, funds received (CIF and VRF) and rotated among member VOs, bookkeeper and bookkeeping, audit compliance etc;
- economic activities undertaken –collective economic activities undertaken such as collective procurement, marketing and sale and production;
- external relations – VOs relations with cluster federations, PRIs, NGOs, line agencies;
- collective social activities undertaken (e.g., alcoholism, gender-based violence, child marriages etc.); and
- self-reliance and sustainability issues.

Proposed Sample

20. The sample proposed for the study is as follows:

Table-1: Sample Proposed for the Household Survey

State Survey Unit	Bihar	Chhattisgarh	Jharkhand	MP	Maharashtra	Odisha	Rajasthan	Total sample
Districts	3	10	8	10	10	10	17	68
Village surveys (one per village)	120 (GPs); 222 villages	100	135	100	150	100	100	907
Village organization survey (one per village)	222	100	135	100	150	100	100	907
SHGs survey (two per village)	444	200	270	200	300	200	200	1814
Households (varies by state)	6050	2500	5535	2500	4500	1500	1900	24,485

Monitoring Data Collection in Field

21. The agency will be responsible for monitoring to ensure that the field survey is of high quality, yielding accurate and verifiable data and conducted in accordance of the field plan approved by the MoRD. The monitoring activities of the agency include:

- confirming that the locations of field work are in accordance with field plan approved by the MoRD;
- conduct of timely random quality field checks to ensure proper administration of survey and data collection;
- conduct of spot checks (visual observation) of at least one interview of each enumerator on any given day;
- revisit of supervisors to a randomly selected sample of at least 15% of the households visited by each enumerator, to double-check the data recorded in respect of key variables;
- implementation of the field protocols provided to the agency by the MoRD;

- back-end data scrutiny of all uploaded questionnaires to ensure that all information recorded is clear and consistent and, where deemed necessary, to clarify with respondents any inconsistencies in their answers with that of the enumerator; and
- deployment of a separate team of back-checkers would be required in the field to confirm the veracity and quality of data collected.

22. The agency will also be required to report field errors observed and (i) provide feedback on the instruments to the central team; and (ii) trouble shoot any data system errors that may occur during data collection.

Data Entry, Management and Quality Assurance

23. The agency will be responsible for developing a data entry program for the listing information and carrying out consistency checks and provide final dataset to the client, if listing is needed. The agency will provide access to internet or other platforms through which data can be transferred from hand-held devices to the server. The final dataset will be provided in STATA and ASCII formats. The agency is required to provide copies of the datasets and data entry error reports/logs that show the frequency of discrepancies noted and actions taken to rectify to the NRLM team. The agency will scrutinize all errors and inconsistencies detected during data entry and consistency programs by revisiting households if major errors are detected. With CAPI-based data collection, real time data will be provided to the NRLM team. Before submitting the data to the NRLM team, supervisors will have to ensure quality of all questionnaires using methods described in point 3.4. Should the NRLM team notice more than 5% errors in data entry, the agency must be prepared to make corrections. For this, the agency will be required to hire the services of data entry operators.

24. The NRLM team will verify a 5% random sample of households against the data entered through checks. In cases of errors found, there will be penalties deducted from the final tranche payment in accordance with the severity of errors. MoRD has the right to cancel the contract and make no further payments or request the work to be done again (including the field work) without any additional costs.

25. The agency will provide the raw as well as final clean copies of the datasets along with a complete codebook to the NRLM team within one week of completion of field work. The agency will maintain log books and documentation of field work which would be submitted at the completion of the survey. The MoRD retains the right to the full quantitative and qualitative data, with complete access to all names, addresses, and

listing and survey data for individuals, households, SHGs and VOs surveyed through this exercise. The agency must be available to respond to queries after the submission of the datasets.

Key Deliverables and Timeline

26. The agency is expected to deliver the following outputs:

- an Inception Report, containing the overall approach and methodology for carrying out the survey, a detailed plan of work, field work plan, outputs and staff assignments with levels of effort by task and sub-task;
- translated draft questionnaires in Hindi, Marathi and Oriya;
- CAPI-based questionnaires, reports from piloting testing of questionnaires with comments and recommendations for changes, finalized CAPI-questionnaires in English, Hind, Oriya and Marathi;
- electronic versions of the survey data as it is being collected on a continuous basis;
- all soft and any hard copies of final questionnaires in English, Oriya, Marathi and Hindi;
- Training manuals for field staff and supervisors in English, Hindi, Marathi and Oriya;
- complete datasets in STATA or ASCII format with a clear report on how data were cleaned and a codebook; and
- a draft final completion report of the survey to be submitted to the NRLM team. This report should include the dates for field visits for each village, supervision checks, problems encountered and methods of resolution.

27. The duration of the contract will be about six months with a spillover of one month to account for unforeseen events. The suggested timeline is indicated below:

Week	Activities/ Deliverables
Week-1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MoRD enters into contracts with the selected agency
Week-2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submission of Inception Report
Week-3 & 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Full contingent of field team on-board Preparation and testing of CAPI completed CAPI questionnaires translated
Week-5 & 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training of field staff completed Training manuals in Hindi and Odiya for field staff and supervisors provided
Week-7 to 30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct of survey in the approved locations as per the guidelines Conduct of random checks as per the guidelines Sending of reports on field survey at agreed intervals Delivery of complete set of clean electronic data along with code books, paper surveys etc Submission of final survey completion report

Institutional Arrangements

28. The agency will work under the overall supervision of the central NRLM team.

Team Composition

29. The agency will be required to deploy the following professional staff:

Table 2: Estimated Time Input of Key Professional Staff for the Survey

S. No.	Professional Staff	Number	Time Input in Months of Each Category of Staff in Months	Total Time Effort in Person Months
A.	Key Staff			
1.	Project Manager	1	6	6

2.	Field Managers	2	6	12
3.	Data Manager	1	4	4
B.	Field Staff			
1.	Field Supervisors	25	5.5	138
2.	Interviewers	100	5.5	550
3.	Back-checkers	15	5.5	83
	Total	114		793

Key Staff

30. The agency must provide a minimum of:

- **One Full-time Project Manager:** Post graduate degree in economics/ rural management/ business management/ finance/engineering with minimum of 10 years of experience in handling large scale socio-economic household surveys such as the National Sample Survey (NSS), Rural Economic Development Survey (REDS), National Family Health Survey (NFHS) and other similar large scale surveys for the GoI, state governments or multilateral agencies and work experience.
- **Two Full-time Field Managers:** Post-Graduate degree in Economics/ Statistics/ Econometrics/Rural Management or other social sciences with a minimum experience of 8 years in working with large household level surveys such as the National Sample Survey (NSS), Rural Economic Development Survey (REDS), National Family Health Survey (NFHS) and such other large scale surveys for the GoI, state governments or multilateral agencies. Experience of working with other surveys where data is entered concurrently with the interview/data collection process preferred.
- **One Full-time Data Manager:** Post-Graduate Degree in Computer Applications or Computer Science or B.Tech in Computer Science or related fields with experience in developing applications using existing sophisticated data entry software (such as CSPro, Blaise, ODK) and managing large database construction and quality control with a minimum of 5 years experience.

Field Team

31. Each field survey team should comprise a minimum of four enumerators and should be headed by one supervisor. Each household questionnaire comprising several modules is expected to take 180-210 minutes for completion (with some time gap between modules). Each household interview will be conducted by two enumerators, one male and one female. It is expected that one team (of 4) completes 8 household interviews per day. The entire sample needs to be covered in 140 days. The agency is

required to hire personnel accordingly with a buffer of 25%. The survey will be conducted in a phased manner. In Phase-1, the entire team will be deployed to one state-Jharkhand. After Jharkhand, sub-teams will be deployed to simultaneously cover in the remaining states, covering three states in Phase-2 and three in Phase-3.

Supervisors

32. Each team will need to have one supervisor to oversee the survey work of four enumerators. The field supervisors will travel with their teams and be responsible for day-to-day supervision and logistics, including contacting community leaders in selected enumeration areas and arranging appointments with respondent households. The field supervisor will also perform quality controls on the information collected by his/her team by randomly attending some interviews, re-interviewing 15% of households on specific modules or overall questionnaires, and reviewing questionnaires. The field supervisor will further be responsible for organizing, tracking of the daily supply of completed questionnaires and submission of the data. Each field supervisor will be responsible for completing the village questionnaire, SHG questionnaires and village organization questionnaire. Field supervisors should have experience in conducting or managing household surveys. The preferred educational requirement for field supervisors is a university degree. Basic ability to communicate in English would be preferred. Knowledge of Hindi is essential. In addition to supervision activities, field supervisors will participate in the pilot test. Field supervisors will also need to participate in all of the training. The agency shall also recruit and train at least **twenty five** percent more supervisors than needed. The agency must ensure that attrition of supervisors is less than **five** percent during the entire course of field survey.

Enumerators/ Interviewers

33. The minimum educational requirement for a household interviewer is a university degree (i.e. 5 years of study after high school). As some knowledge of separate dialects may be required in remote areas, it is advised that the agency recruits interviewers living in such areas. This is not a mandatory requirement and is left to the discretion of the agency. The agency shall also recruit and train at least **thirty** percent more interviewers than required to ensure that suitable replacements are available for the team members leaving during field work or those who do not demonstrate sufficient proficiency following training. The agency is required to provide **at least 40% female** enumerators for the training. The agency must ensure that attrition of enumerators is less than **ten** percent during the entire survey.

Back-Checkers

34. Once data collection from a village is complete and CAPI questionnaires provided, the village would need to be revisited by one back-checker. The back-checker will be responsible for verifying the data submitted by ensuring that interviews were conducted according to protocol, the correct households were interviewed, field some modules of the questionnaires and match responses to check for fraudulent or erroneous data. This will be done for 5% of the sample. Back-checkers should have experience in conducting or managing household surveys. The preferred education requirement for field supervisors is a university degree. Basic ability to communicate in English would be preferred. Knowledge of Hindi is essential. In addition to back-checking activities, they will participate in the pilot test. Back-checkers will also need to participate in the training. The agency shall also recruit and train at least **twenty** percent more back-checkers than required to provide for replacement due to attrition. The agency must ensure that attrition of supervisors is less than **five** percent during the entire survey.

Equipment and Logistics

35. The agency will provide the requisite number of hand-held devices and other tools to facilitate digital data collection in the selected states by survey teams. The MoRD will bear no responsibility for the payment, storage and field level deployment and use of hand-held devices. Following is a suggested list of equipment to be provided and logistic arrangements to be made during the contract duration:

- **Field Supplies:** The agency will provide all supplies required for field staff. This should include a token of appreciation to be given to the respondents in lieu of their time.
- **Office Equipment:** The agency will secure the necessary office and computer equipment for survey management and adequate number of CAPI devices. Sample copies of printed questionnaire in English, Hindi and Odiya and training manual will be provided to each supervisor and enumerators.
- **Maintenance:** The agency will take steps to ensuring that all equipment and vehicles are properly maintained and can be quickly serviced so as to remain operable.
- **Authorizations:** The agency will secure all required authorizations and clearances necessary to perform the data collection in a timely fashion from different SRLMs with the support of MoRD.
- **Transportation:** The agency will make appropriate transportation arrangements to conduct field work. Sufficient transportation to ensure that the field work is carried out smoothly will be needed. Evidence that supervisors will be able to travel to observe interviews, provide support to their team members, as well as

evidence that interviewers have the transportation needed to reach their households will be required.

Future Use of Data

36. All information collected both print and electronic as well as the software application designed specifically for this project, in whatever format, will be the property of the MoRD. The agency is not permitted to use the data for any other purpose, nor is it permitted to license the data to be used by others.